	cument 45-3	Filed 08/22/2008	Page 1 of 8
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	1	INDE	×
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	2		- ^
000	3	Deposition of DANIEL HWANG	
ESTHER HWANG, Plaintiff,	4 5	Tuesday, June 3, 2008	
vs. Case No. C07-02718 MMC	6	Page	
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO, ET AL.,	8	EXAMINATION BY MR. CONNOLLY	5
Defendants.	9 10		
	11	Certified Questions:	
Deposition of	13	Page Line	
DANIEL HWANG	14		
Tuesday, June 3, 2008	15		
	17		
	18		
REPORTED BY: LESLIE CASTRO, CSR #8876	19		
12. ON ED B1. LEGLIE CASTRO, CSR #88/6	20		
BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES	22		
Court Reporting Services 41 Sutter Street, Suite 1605 San Francisco, California 94104	23		
(415) 982-4849	24		
	25		

EXHIBITS BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, pursuant to Notice, and on Tuesday, June 3, 2008, commencing at the hour of Deposition of DANIEL HWANG 9:31 o'clock a.m. thereof, at the OFFICE OF THE CITY Tuesday, June 3, 2008 ATTORNEY, Fox Plaza, Seventh Floor, 1390 Market Street, San Francisco, California 94102, before me, (No exhibits were offered.) LESLIE CASTRO, a Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the State of California, personally appeared DANIEL HWANG called as a witness by the Defendant, who, being by me first duly sworn, was thereupon examined and testified as hereinafter set forth. APPEARANCES: LAW OFFICES OF JOHN L. BURRIS, 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 1120, Oakland, California 94621, represented by BENJAMIN NISENBAUM, Attorneys at Law, appeared as counsel on behalf of the Plaintiff. OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY, Fox Plaza, Sixth Floor, 1390 Market Street, San Francisco, California 94102, represented by SEAN F. CONNOLLY, Deputy City Attorney, appeared as counsel on behalf of the Defendant. --000--BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849

į					
1	Case 3:07-cv-02718-MMC Document 45				
2	being first duly sworn, testified as follows:				
3	ASSA SE				
4	EXAMINATION BY MR. CONNOLLY:				
5					
6	MR. CONNOLLY: Q Good morning.				
7	Do you want to state your name for the record,				
8	please.				
9	A. Daniel Hwang.				
10	Q. Do you want to spell it.				
11	A. D-A-N-I-E-L. Last name, H-W-A-N-G.				
12	Q. Good morning, Mr. Hwang. I briefly introduced				
13	myself this morning, and again for the record, my name				
14	is Sean Connolly. I'm a deputy city attorney. I				
15	represent the City and some of the other named				
16	defendants in this action in a federal lawsuit brought				
17	by, I believe, your sister, Esther Hwang.				
18	Present in the room is the court reporter and				
19	Mr. Nisenbaum from Mr. Burris' office representing				
20	Plaintiff's interests.				
21	I had asked you before we went on the record				
22	whether you had ever sat for a deposition before. You				
23	indicated you had not. So at this point I'm going to				
24	spend a little time in explaining what we call the rules				
25	of the road for a deposition. It typically, lawyers				

ሐ 1	Tille a	1.00/00/0000 Dear 0.ef 0					
3		1 08/22/2008 Page 2 of 8					
1	will explain this just to help move the process along						
2	and facilitate the main objective here today.						
3	So a couple of things: You understand that						
4	before we	before we went on the record you took an oath					
5	administered by the court reporter?						
6	A.	Yes.					
7	Q.	And you understand that that oath is the same					
8	oath that is	s given in a court of law?					
9	A.	Yes.					
10	Q.	And you're under the same penalty of perjury.					
11		Do you understand that?					
12	A.	Yes.					
13	Q.	And today what we want is the truth to the					
14	extent you	know it. If you don't know an answer to a					
15	question, j	ust let me know. If you are guessing or					
16	speculating	g or you could make an educated guess, just					
17	explain tha	at's what you're doing.					
18	A.	Okay.					
19	Q.	There are a couple of things - a couple of					
20	rules that I	want to make sure I articulate and explain					
21	to you. 1 k	now the court reporter would appreciate it.					
22		One is, as you can see, she is taking down					
23	everything	that is said here in exchange between us. As					
24	a result, it's	s very we must both be careful to speak					

BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849

5

25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849

slower and not speak on top of each other.

And what that means is in a normal conversation, I can see you and you can see me and I can see gestures and I can see your head nodding up and down like you're doing now. The court reporter can't pick any of that up. So it's important that you explain your answers.

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

If you're nodding, for instance say "yes" or "no." From time to time I will say "Is that a "yes" or "Is that a "no" because I can see you nodding. And I'm not trying to be rude, I'm just trying to point out that you need to articulate your response for the record so it can be recorded.

You need to let me finish asking my question although you may know what my question is before I finish asking it. And likewise, I'll let you finish your answer before I start asking the next question. In normal conversation it happens all the time. But here again, the court reporter can't take down two voices at once.

Lunderstand

The other thing is, although I do not anticipate we'll be here long, if you need to take a break for any reason, use the restroom, get a glass of water, whatever it is, food, there's a cafe downstairs and a Starbucks downstairs, just let me know and there will be no problem.

And there are a few other admonitions that I could state at this time. But I'll wait until the end or if they come up because they're only relevant when they become an issue.

All right. Having said that, let's move

You had stated your name is Daniel Hwang. And am I pronouncing it correctly?

Q. First of all, where do you live, presently?

In 1165 66th Street, Emeryville, California. A.

And do you have -- how long have you lived

there?

along.

A little over a year.

Q. And do you own or rent that place?

A.

Q. Do you anticipate being there for some time?

A. No plans of selling right now.

And the reason we typically ask witnesses for that information is to the extent we might need them later at a later point in time, for whatever purpose, trial, we need to know how to contact that person.

Do you have a phone or cell phone that's your

BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849

	Case 3:07-cv-02718-MMC Document 45-	<u> </u>	Filed 08/22/2008 Page 3 of 8
1	glass.	1	_
2	Q. And did you say you had a few glasses of wine	2	Q. Do you recall what Esther Hwang and Nathan Flores ordered to eat?
3	while you were waiting?	3	
4	A. I'm trying to remember if it was if we	4	A. Not specifically. But one fish, maybe one
5	ordered a bottle there or if it was a few glasses. I	5	meat. That's all I remember.
6	know we ordered a bottle. I don't remember if it was at		Q. Now, when Ms. Hwang, I'm referring to your
7	the table or at the bar and we took it over there.	6	sister and let me let's make a digress for a
8	Q. But in any case, you had at least one glass of	7	moment to make some clarifications.
9	wine while you were waiting?	8	Your mother, she was at dinner that night?
10	A. Yes	9	A. Yes.
11		10	Q. And what is her full name?
12	The point you were seated. In other	11	A. Hyn Ho.
530433	words, again, I'm making an assumption but I'm trying to	12	Q. But her last name is Hwang?
13	leap through this so we get through the preliminaries.	13	A. Yes.
14	But at some point I'm assuming your sister	14	Q. And your sister's last name is Hwang?
15	Esther Hwang and her boyfriend Nathan Flores showed up	15	A. Yes.
16	and you were - what do they call it you were taken to	16	Q. Your wife does not go by Hwang
17	your table?	17	A. No.
18	A. Yes.	18	Q is that correct?
19	 Do you recall how long you were at the 	19	A. Lim. No, it's not Hwang. Lim, L-I-M.
20	restaurant overall?	20	Q. Lauren?
21	I would say a few hours.	21	Lauren is not her legal name. Her legal name
22	Q. And do you recall what you ordered?	22	is Sung, S-U-N-G. Lauren is —
23	A. I usually get the king size, the extra -	23	Q. You said her last name is Lim?
24	Q. The King Henry?	24	
25	A. Yes.	25	and the representation of the second of the
	BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES]25	Q. So when I refer to Ms. Hwang, I'm referring to

BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849

21

BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849 22

```
plaintiff Esther Hwang. And if there's -- if it's not
1
                                                                                                       Do you recall drinking alcohol at the table?
                                                                                     1
2
     clear, just let me know and I'll clarify.
                                                                                     2
3
           A. Okay.
                                                                                     3
                                                                                                 Q.
                                                                                                      Do you recall what you, Daniel Hwang, drank?
4
           Q. I probably won't have many questions about
5
     your mother.
                                                                                     5
                                                                                                      What did you drink?
6
                 When Ms. Hwang and Mr. Flores arrived at the
                                                                                     6
                                                                                                       Red wine, Merlot.
     restaurant, did they have - did they stop before being
7
                                                                                     7
                                                                                                       And did you order more than one bottle -- did
8
     seated to have anything to drink at the bar or in the
                                                                                     8
                                                                                          you order a bottle of wine?
9
     waiting area with you?
                                                                                     9
                                                                                                     Yes. Again, I'm not sure if it was at the
10
           A. No. To the best of my knowledge or
                                                                                    10
                                                                                          table or at the bar and brought it over. But I know we
11
     remembering, they came in, they were hungry because it
                                                                                    11
                                                                                          still had enough to bring at the table.
     was a little late. So we asked to be seated right away.
12
                                                                                     12
                                                                                                      Did you order another bottle subsequent to
                 They came over and we hugged and stuff,
13
                                                                                    13
                                                                                          that first bottle?
14
     greetings.
                                                                                    14
                                                                                                       Not to my knowledge.
15
                                                                                    15
                                                                                                       Did you order anything else of an alcoholic
16
                 And I'm interested right now just in the
                                                                                    16
                                                                                          nature before -- other than the bottle of wine that
17
     drinking pattern at the restaurant.
                                                                                    17
                                                                                          you've mentioned?
18
                 Okay.
                                                                                    18
                                                                                                       Not that I remember.
                                                                                                A.
19
           Q.
                 So now, let's move to when you had been seated
                                                                                    19
                                                                                                      Did you ever have any mixed drinks, gin and
20
     at the table.
                                                                                    20
                                                                                          tonic, martinis?
21
           A.
                                                                                    21
                                                                                                       For myself?
22
           Q. And I don't want to put words in your mouth.
                                                                                    22
                                                                                                Q. Correct.
23
     But you mentioned that you thought maybe you had ordered
                                                                                    23
24
     wine, maybe in the form of a bottle at some point and
                                                                                    24
                                                                                                Q.
                                                                                                      Did you order a bottle of white wine?
25
     maybe at the table.
                                                                                    25
                                                                                                A.
                                                                                                      No. My recollection is red wine because we
```

20 21 22	Q. little bit. You	Now, is it — let me just — let's back up a u're certain that one — you are certain le ordered one bottle of wine?	20 21 22	A. I don't know. Q. But I'm saying – if you don't know, I'm asking the other end of that
16 17 18 19	recollect. Q.	I remember how I was seated. So I'm to Sure. I don't remember, to be honest.	1.00	glasses. So there was a little bit of getting bumped when people were walking by. So I don't think so. But Q. Is it possible?
12 13 14 15	A. Q. A. Q.	No. — do you recall? I do recall she did not. Did Nathan Flores?	12 13 14 15	A. I don't think so. Just because – the table was small. We complained about the table because it wasn't in a good location in the restaurant. There were so many dishes and the glasses for the water, the wine
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	perspective alcohol, win A. Q. A. Q.	ut from a little bit more broader	3 4 5 6 7 8	who ordered it? A. I ordered it. Q. Is it possible more than one bottle was ordered, but you don't recall for sure? A. I don't think so, but I'm not 100 percent sure. Q. Is it possible that more than one bottle was ordered? Let me rephrase the question: Is it possible that more than one bottle ever wine was ordered for the table?
1 2	Caraseura Q.	Meriot CV-02718-MMC Now, I'm going to ask you the same seri	Document 45-3	Filed 08/22/2008 Page 4 of 8 Q. Was that person you or was it someone else,

1						
1	A.	I don't think so.				
2	Q. So are you saying that you're certain that					
3	only one b	pottle of wine was ordered?				
4	A.	Pretty sure. I don't know if that's an answer				
5	or not.					
6	Q.	Okay. That's good enough.				
7		Do you recall seeing your sister Esther Hwang				
8	drink wine	from a wine glass?				
9	A.	I know I remember at least one time because we				
10	toasted. It	t was for a combination of my Mother's Day				
11	happy Mot	ther's Day and also for my wife's birthday. So				
12	we did toa	st the glasses.				
13	Q.	Do you recall seeing your sister Esther Hwang				
14	drink wine	during dinner?				
15	A.	No. Not that much at all.				
16	Q.	Listen very closely to my question.				
17	A.	Okay.				
18	Q.	Do you recall seeing your sister Esther Hwang				
19	drink wine	at dinner?				
20	A.	Only at the toast. She took a sip, I know				
21	(indicating).				
22	Q.	Do you know who poured her that glass of wine				
23	that she to	pasted?				
24	MR.	NISENBAUM: Objection. Misstates his testimony				
25	that she ha	ad a glass of wine.				

```
1
            MR. CONNOLLY: Q Did she drink directly from
 2
       the bottle?
 3
            A.
 4
                  The glass of wine - the wine that she drank,
 5
       was it taken from a wine glass?
 6
            A. Can you repeat that?
 7
            Q. How did she drink the wine that you saw her
 8
      drink?
 9
            A. From a wine glass, the normal (indicating).
 10
            Q. The wine glass?
11
12
            Q. We call them wine glasses.
13
                 Yeah, yeah.
14
                 So when you saw her sip pursuant to the toast,
15
      it was from a wine glass?
16
            A.
17
            Q. I didn't get the sense that your sister drank
18
      from the bottle directly. But for Mr. Nisenbaum, I want
19
      to make sure the clarification was made.
20
            MR. NISENBAUM: I would not want it to be inferred
21
      that was it a full huge glass of wine for the toast.
22
            MR. CONNOLLY: I haven't asked that question.
23
      Let's do this: Let me ask my questions and then you can
24
      ask follow-up to clarify.
25
            MR. NISENBAUM: That's the basis of the objection.
```

		7			
1	Case R. 3:07.5CV-02718-MMC Document 45	-3	Filed 08/22/2008 Page 5 of 8		
2	only saw your sister drink from the glass once	2	A. I remember because that's usually what		
3	during the course of the evening while you were at	3	drink.		
4	The House of Prime Rib?	4	Q. Do you recall how many glasses of wine your		
5	A. I'm pretty sure.	5	wife had to drink?		
6	 Q. So are you saying that you had no opportunity 	6	A. Not sure. But she does like wine		
7	to see her drink - let me rephrase.	7	Q. Do you recall if your mother or father drank		
8	Were you watching her the entire time?	8	wine that evening?		
9	A. No.	9	MANY 1024 May 24 10		
10	 Q. Were there times during the course I think 	10	A. They took a few sips. I know because we always order diet Coke and wine because they got upset		
11	you said you were there two, two and a half hours.	11	that we ordered so many refills of diet Coke.		
12	Were there times during that two, two and a	12	10 m		
13	half hours that your attention was directed towards	13	The year don't know how much white your sister		
14	other people at the table?	14	A. Correct		
15	A. Yes. We had just conversations back and	15			
16	forth. So, you know, my eyes or my head.	16	Q. And you don't know how much wine Mr. Flores drank; correct?		
17	Q. Did anyone order champagne?	17	A. Correct.		
18	A. Not that I remember.	18	3000 (B-3000-F-7)		
19	Q. Do you recall Mr. Flores drinking wine?	19	The body of the bottle of white that		
20	Yes. I know for the toast, everyone toasted.	20	you ordered was finished? In other words, exhausted, completed?		
21	So it was a toast. And again, I don't know, but	21	Control of the Contr		
22	how everyone took a sip at least.	22	A. I don't remember if it was completely finished. But I'm sure because we — they had poured it		
23	Q. Do you recall how many glasses of wine you had	23	into everyone's glass because we told her it was for a		
24	during the course of the evening?	24	toast. So I don't know how much was left. But I'm not		
25	A. I had two glasses.	25	sure.		
	BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849 29	_ 1=- [BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849 30		

1	Q.	Was it one of those situations that you	1
2		find in restaurants where the waiter will	2
3		come around from time to time and	3
4	A.	Fill it.	4
5	Q.	– fill up the glasses at the table?	5
6	A.	I believe so.	6
7	Q.	Is that what happened here?	7
8	A.	Yes. But we told him specifically because I	8
9	know, like	, my parents don't drink that much. Just give	9
10	it as a toas	st. We remember that. I don't remember how	10
11	much they	put in. But they didn't put in a, like, a	11
12	full, half or	anything (indicating).	12
13	Q.	Did the waiter or waitress come back from time	13
14	to time an	d top off the wine glasses? When I say "top	14
15	off," I don'	t mean filled to the brim.	15
16	A.	No, because I don't like my wine actually at a	16
17	certain lev	el because it tastes better so I can have	17
18	more. So	they come back from time to time. That's the	18
19	answer.		19
20	Q.	Now, do you recall someone taking a camera out	20
21	and taking	photographs of your table, people at your	21
22	table?		22
23	A.	Yes.	23
24	Q.	Who was that?	24
25	A.	I think Nathan might have taken some pictures.	25

I think we had about two digital cameras. I'm not sure, but I believe so. And then they took - the restaurant took I think a Polaroid when we were doing. I'm not sure it was during the candle blowing or throughout the night. Q. Did the restaurant give you the Polaroid or give someone at the table the Polaroid? A. I didn't receive it, but maybe they did. I'm not sure. Q. And who besides Nathan -- who had -- who do you believe had the other camera? Maybe my dad. Q. And do you have - can you estimate how many photos were taken? Maybe about - I can estimate maybe six or seven throughout the night. Q. That's an estimate? That's an estimate. Q. And were you able ever at any point after that to see any of these photographs? A. No, I have not. Q. Do you recall looking at the Polaroid photograph that night taken by the restaurant? In other words, was it passed around? I believe it was passed around. I think I saw

Cas	e 3	:07-cv-02718-MMC [Document 45-3	Filed	d 08/22/2008 Page 6 of
1	olaro	id, but I wouldn't remember which picture it	1	A.	No. We haven't seen any pictures from that
was.		_	2	night. No	o, there isn't any pictures that I know of and
	_	Does that make sense?	3		seen even once after. But I do remember the
	Q.	No.	4		. But I don't remember exactly what was on the
	A.	How we were set or if it was the whole table	le. 5	picture.	,
If it w	as jus	st during the candle blowing. That's what I	6	Q.	And I'll ask you again –
mean	١.	10	7	A.	
	Q.	So you remember seeing a Polaroid photo	graph, 8	Q.	
but yo	ou're	not sure what it depicted at this point?	9	that Pola	roid photograph is right now?
	A.	Yes, that's correct.	10	Α.	
	Q.	Do you recall ever receiving - do you recal	11	Q.	
ever :	seein	g a hard copy of one of those photographs	12	Α.)
taken	by a	digital camera provided by Nathan	13	Q.	,
	A.	No.	14	0.7750	And did you all leave together, did the group lether or did you leave at different times?
	Q.	- to your wife?	15	A.	
	A.	No.	16		No, we all left together, came out of the at together.
		I'm sorry, could I ask the clarification?	17	Q.	
	Q.	Yes.	18	200) room mot or all, do you recall
	A.	So you asked if I saw any pictures that Nati			you were feeling intoxicated at any level, tipsy
gave	to my		20	or drunk	
2883 343		Is that what you are asking?	20	Α.	No. Because -
	Q.	Generally, yes.	21	Q.	No, you don't recall? Let me ask you first:
	A.	No. I did not.			ecall whether or not you were intoxicated at any
	Q.	Is there something else that might fit that	23	level after	200000 145000
descri	2000	that you would respond differently?	24	Α.	No, I was not.
	P. 1.011	BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES	25	Q.	We have to be real clear here for the record. BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES

ſ		
1	I'm asking	if you recall your state of sobriety or
2	intoxicatio	n which is just a "yes" or "no" question.
3	A.	No. Maybe
4	Q.	Listen carefully to my question.
5	MR.	CONNOLLY: Settle down.
6	Q.	Listen closely to the question. I'm going to
7	ask you th	e question that you're answering. But there's
8	a prelimina	ary question that we have to ask to confirm
9	that you a	ctually have a recollection one way or the
10	other.	
11		Do you understand what I'm saying?
12	A.	Yes, I do.
13	Q.	Do you recall your state of sobriety at the
14	point in tim	ne that you left the restaurant?
15	A.	Yes.
16	Q.	What was your state of sobriety at the time
17	you left the	e restaurant?
18	A.	I was fine.
19	Q.	You felt fine?
20	A.	Not intoxicated. Full meal. I was full.
21	Q.	And you testified you only had two glasses of
22	wine?	
23	A.	At the most.
24	Q.	Now, do you recall whether or not your sister
25	Esther look	ked like she was intoxicated?

25	asking and	I not the question I'm next going to ask. We	
24	Q.	- is your answer is to the question that I'm	
23	A.	I understand.	
22	be clear w	hat we're talking about	
21	table from	each other, later when it's read, it has to	
20	know what	t we're talking about when we sit across the	
19	taken dow	n in transcript form. And although you and I	
18	in some of	these questions. But it's because it's being	
17		We lawyers tend to we start splitting hairs	
16	Q.	Okay.	
15	A.	That, I don't remember.	
14	Q.	Was her face red?	
13	A.	No.	
12	Q.	Did she look as though she had been drinking?	
11	A.	No.	
10	Q.	Was she intoxicated?	
9	A.	Yes. I—	
8	intoxicated		
7	Q.	Do you recall whether or not she was	
6	A.	Yes.	
5	restaurant	Did you see your sister as you left the	
4	evenmore		
2	Q. even more	Do you recall having - I'll try to make it	
101	_	Can you repeat the question?	

35

34

	0 0 07 00740 MMO D	٦٥	F'I. 1 00/00/0000 P		
1	Case 3:07-cv-02718-MMC Document 45 do that all time in normal conversation. But that's why	1 3	Filed 08/22/2008 Page 7 of 8		
2	there's certain questions in between the question I need	1	and she was studying for the bar and this and that. I		
3	to ask first.	2	didn't want to ask her any specifics because I wasn't		
4	887	3	there.		
5	Have you seen your sister drunk before? A. I want to say when she was yourger.	4	 Q. Let me ask you again. This is one of these 		
6	man to day intertante was younger.	5	situations that I want you to listen closely to what I'm		
7	Q. And was that a matter of years before?	6	asking.		
	We're talking when she was maybe in college.	7	Earlier in the deposition, I asked you about		
8	Everyone seems younger to me these days.	8	conversations you had with your sister Esther in		
9	 In college, I've seen her drunk. We don't go 	9	connection with this deposition. In other words, I had		
10	out, like, at night together, that kind of thing, kind	10	asked you things you had done to prepare for this		
11	of, big brother, kind of, thing. It's, kind of, weird.	11	deposition, people you had spoken to.		
12	Q. And you're the older brother?	12	And you mentioned you had spoken to your		
13	I'm the older brother.	13	sister Esther approximately – at least once 30 days		
14	Q. Do you have other siblings?	14	before the deposition. We're approximating the days.		
15	 No. Just the two of us that I know of. 	15	But I believe you said approximately a month before		
16	Q. I'm sorry. I missed that one.	16	today's deposition?		
17	A. That I know of.	17	A. Yes.		
18	Q. I'm going to go back one more time and ask	18	Q. And you had referenced the fact that your		
19	about your conversations with Ms. Hwang before this	19			
20	deposition about the deposition.	20	- The reserved a suppoend and site that called -		
21	Did she discuss with you anything having to do	21	she, Esther, had called in connection with that.		
22	with the drinking pattern of the evening?	22	My question is: During those discussions at		
23	A. No. I know she she was stressed about it.		that point in time, did Esther mention to you anything		
24	Not just about – I don't know if it was about the	23	about the drinking of alcohol on the evening of the		
25	deposition, but just the whole incident, the whole thing	24	incident?		
[BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES	25	A. No.		
	(415) 982-4849 37		BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849 38		

1	Q. Did she remind you what you had had? Did she	1	say 200- something dollars. 250-, around there.
2	talk to you about what – what she had had to drink?	2	Q. And you said you paid for dinner?
3	A. No.	3	A. Yes.
4	Q. Do you understand my question?	4	Q. The entire dinner?
5	I do understand the question.	5	A. Yes.
6	Q. Did you – when you left the restaurant, when	6	Q. And in what form did you pay for it?
7	was the next time you heard from Esther after you left	7	A. I believe – I know it was credit card. I'm
8	the restaurant? So let me ask that whole question all	8	just trying to think which credit card it was. I think
9	over again.	9	it was my American Express.
10	When is the next time you heard from your	10	Q. How many credit cards do you have or did you
11	sister Esther after you left the restaurant that	11	have at the time of the incident?
12	evening?	12	A. Usually I have my AMEX, my ATM Visa debit card
13	I think a few days later, two or three days	13	and another Visa normally.
14	maybe. I know I'm just trying to think if it was a	14	Q. And why is it that you think you paid with
15	few days later. I don't remember exactly which day.	15	your AMEX?
16	Q. Okay.	16	Mostly, I use it for restaurants, the AMEX.
17	And how was it that you heard from her?	17	That's a good question.
18	A. She we found out my parents found out	18	Q. And you paid for the drinks at the bar, also?
19	that that incident happened. And so I was worried. So	19	A. I had everything come to the table.
20	I called. She said she's been to the doctors. She was	20	Q. So it was combined
21	upset, she was scared. She was telling me about the	21	A. Yes.
22	incident.	22	Q into one bill?
23	Q. Let me go back to the restaurant for a moment.	23	Did anyone else offer to pay?
24	Do you recall how much the bill was?	24	A. They just assumed, the husband of the birthday
25	Oh, I paid for it, actually. I would probably	25	and the oldest son. So it's, kind of, traditional, I
	BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES		BONNIP I WACNED C ACCOCTAME

1		¬ '		
1	Case 3:07-cv-02718-MMC Document 45	-3	Filed 08/22/2008 Page 8 of 8	
2	don't know if Mr. Nisenbaum has any follow-up questions, but he's entitled, also.	1	STATE OF CALIFORNIA)	
3	None Control of Control of Control	2) Ss.	
4	MR. NISENBAUM: I don't.	3	COUNTY OF CONTRA COSTA)	
5	MR. CONNOLLY: Thank-you.	4		
	COURT REPORTER: For the record, who would like a	5	I hereby certify that the witness in the	
6	copy?	6	foregoing deposition, named DANIEL HWANG, was by me	
7	MR. NISENBAUM: Yes, I would.	7	duly sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth, and	
8	(Whereupon, the deposition adjourned.	8	nothing but the truth in the within-entitled cause;	
9	At 10:28 a.m.)	9	that said deposition was taken at the time and place	
10		10	therein stated; that the testimony of said witness was	
11		11	reported by me,	
12	DANIEL HWANG	12	LESLIE CASTRO.	
13	J. WILLEY WARD	13	A Certified Shorthand Reporter and disinterested	
14		14	person, and was thereafter transcribed into	
15		15	typewriting; and that the pertinent provisions of the	
16		16	applicable code or rules of civil procedure relating	
17		17	to the notification of the witness and counsel for the	
18		18	parties hereto of the availability of the original	
19		19	transcript of deposition for reading, correcting and	
20		20	signing have been complied with.	
21		21		
22		22	And I further certify that I am not of	
23		23	counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties	
24		24	to said deposition, nor in any way interested in the	
25			outcome of the cause named in said caption.	
L	BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES	25	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my	
	(415) 982-4849 53		BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849	54

[
1	hand and affixed my seal of office the 14th day of	1 ERRATA SHEET
2	June, 2008.	2
3		3 PAGE LINE CHANGE
4		4
5		5
6	LESUE CASTRO	6
7	LESLIE CASTRO C.S.R. No. 8876	7
8		
9		8 — —
10		9 — —
11		10
12		11 — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — —
13		12
14		13
15		14
		15
16		16
17		17
18		18
19		19
20		20
21		21
22		22
23		23
24		24
25		25

55

BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849

BONNIE L. WAGNER & ASSOCIATES (415) 982-4849